

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

ALEJANDRO PEREZ GABAY,  
Plaintiff,

v.

Case No. 10-12702

PARK WEST GALLERIES, INC.,  
KEATON, INC., d/b/a PARK WEST AT  
SEA, PWG FLORIDA, INC., d/b/a FINE  
ART SALES, INC., SMART PUBLISHERS  
OF FINE ART, INC., d/b/a SMART  
PUBLISHING, PLYMOUTH  
AUCTIONEERING SERVICES, LTD.,  
RAMI ROTKOPF, ALBERT SCAGLIONE,  
and ALBERT MOLINA,  
Defendants.

Honorable Patrick J. Duggan

---

**JUDGMENT**

On July 8, 2010, Plaintiff filed an action alleging copyright infringement. On this date, the Court entered an Opinion and Order holding that Plaintiff is not entitled to relief.

Accordingly,

**IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED**, that Plaintiff's action against Keaton, Inc., d/b/a Park West at Sea, and Plymouth Auctioneering Services, Ltd. is **DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE**;

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED**, that Plaintiff's action against the remaining defendants is **DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE**.

DATE: December 22, 2010

s/PATRICK J. DUGGAN  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Copies to:

Donald L. Payton, Esq.  
Jason D. Killips, Esq.  
Rodger D. Young, Esq.  
Benjamin K. Steffans, Esq.  
J. Michael Huget, Esq.